1

Mindfulness-based school interventions: A systematic review of outcome evidence quality by study design

Mindfulness

Mary L. Phan¹, Tyler L. Renshaw¹, Julie Caramanico², Jeffrey M. Greeson³, Elizabeth MacKenzie⁴, Zabryna Atkinson-Diaz², Natalie Doppelt², Hungtzu Tai⁵, David S. Mandell², and Heather J. Nuske²

Corresponding author email: mary.phan@usu.edu

¹Department of Psychology, Utah State University, Logan, USA

²Penn Center for Mental Health, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, USA

³Department of Psychology, Rowan University, Glassboro, USA

⁴Graduate School of Education, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, USA

⁵School of Health in Social Science, University of Edinburgh, United Kingdom

2

Online Resource 2

Design and Methods Included in Review

Author (year)	MBI	Research design	Evaluation design	Control	Mediator	Outcome measure type	Teacher training	Evidence rating
01. Atkinson & Wade (2015)	Based off of the "body project" - mindfulness, acceptance based practice, MBCT	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Researcher	Self-report	No	1-
02. Bakosh et al (2016)	Mindful-based social emotional learning (MBSEL) program	Mixed	Pre-post (with non randomized control group)	Active control group	Teacher	Teacher report	Yes	2+
03. Bakosh et al (2018)	Audio-guided MBI and MBSR-adapted program for 10 weeks	Quantitative	RCT	Passive control group	Teacher	Teacher report	Yes	1+
04. Bannirchelvam et al (2017)	8 week MBI	Qualitative	Case series	No control group	Trained instructor	Self-report	No	2-
05. Bauer et al (2019)	8 week mindfulness program	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Trained instructor	Self-report & cognitive tests	No	1+
06. Beauchemin et al (2008)	5 week mindfulness meditation program	Mixed	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Teacher	Teacher report & self-report	Yes	2-

Author (year)	MBI	Research design	Evaluation design	Control	Mediator	Outcome measure type	Teacher training	Evidence rating
07. Bei et al (2013)	Six-session program based on Bootzin & Stevens	Quantitative	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	N/A	Self-report	No	2-
08. Bennett & Dorjee (2015)	MBSR	Mixed	Pre-post (with non randomized control group)	Passive control group	Researcher	Self-report	No	2+
09. Berger et al (2018)	Call to Care- Israel (C2C-I)	Quantitative	RCT	Passive control group	Researcher and teacher	Self-report	No	1+
10. Bernay et al (2016)	Pause Breathe Smile: 8 lesson mindfulness module	Mixed	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Trained instructor	Observation & self-report	No	1++
11. Black & Fernando (2014)	5-week mindfulness based curriculum	Quantitative	Pre-post (with non randomized control group)	Active control group	Mindfulness instructor	Teacher report	No	2-
12. Bluth et al (2016)	Learning to BREATHE	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Trained instructor	Self-report	No	1-
13. Bradley et al (2018)	Four Pillars of Well-being Curriculum	Quantitative	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Teacher	Teacher report & self-report	Yes	2-
14. Britton et al (2014)	6 week mindfulness education program	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Teacher	Self-report	Yes	1-
15. Broderick & Metz (2009)	Learning to BREATHE	Mixed	RCT	Passive control group	Researcher	Self-report	No	1-

Author (year)	MBI	Research design	Evaluation design	Control	Mediator	Outcome measure type	Teacher training	Evidence rating
16. Burckhardt et al (2017)	ACT	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Researcher	Self-report	Yes	1-
17. Costello & Lawler (2014)	5-week school- based mindfulness program	Mixed	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Teacher	Self-report	Yes	2-
18. Crescentini et al (2016)	8 week mindfulness- oriented intervention	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Researcher	Teacher report & self-report	No	1++
19. Davenport & Pagnini (2016)	Langerian Mindfulness	Qualitative	Case study	No control group	Teacher	N/A	Yes	3
20. der Gucht et al (2017)	8 week MBSR	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Trained instructor	Self-report	No	1-
21. Dove & Costello (2017)	TRIPLE R: Robust, Resilient, Ready to Go 6 week intervention program	Quantitative	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Researcher	Self-report	No	2+
22. Emerson et al (2017)	4 week mindfulness program	Mixed	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Researcher	Self-report	No	2-

Author (year)	MBI	Research design	Evaluation design	Control	Mediator	Outcome measure type	Teacher training	Evidence rating
23. Eva & Thayer (2017)	Learning to BREATHE: A Curriculum for Cultivating Emotion regulation, Attention, and Performance	Mixed	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Counselor	Self-report	No	2-
24. Felver et al (2013)	Soles of the Feet (SOF)	Qualitative	Case series	No control group	Researcher	Teacher report, student self- report, direct observation	No	3
25. Flook et al (2015)	12-week mindfulness- based Kindness Curriculum	Quantitative	RCT	Passive control group	Researcher and mindfulness instructor	Teacher report & cognitive tests	No	1+
26. Franco et al (2016)	Meditación Fluir for 10 weeks	Mixed	RCT	Passive control group	Counselor	Self-report	Yes	1+
27. Fung et al (2016)	12 week MBI	Quantitative	RCT	Passive control group	N/A	Self-report & parent report	No	1-
28. Gouda et al (2016)	MBSR	Quantitative	Pre-post (with non randomized control group)	Passive control group	Trained instructor	Self-report	Yes	2-
29. Gould et al (2012)	12 week yoga- inspired mindfulness program	Quantitative	Pre-post (with non randomized control group)	Passive control group	Researcher	Self-report	No	2-

Author (year)	MBI	Research design	Evaluation design	Control	Mediator	Outcome measure type	Teacher training	Evidence rating
30. Idler et al (2017)	12 week mindfulness and fluency program	Mixed	Pre-post (with non randomized control group)	Active control group	Researcher	Self-report & cognitive tests	No	3
31. Janz et al (2019)	Calmspace	Quantitative	RCT	Passive control group	Teacher	Teacher report & cognitive tests	Yes	1++
32. Johnson et al (2016)	Dot b intervention	Mixed	RCT	Active control group	Researcher	Teacher report & self-report	No	1-
33. Johnson et al (2017)	9 week mindfulness education program	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Teacher	Self-report & parent report	No	1-
34. Juliano et al (2020)	8 week MBI – Mindful Schools	Quantitative	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Trained instructor	Neuropsycholo gical measures	No	2-
35. Kang et al (2018)	6 Week Mindfulness Meditation	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Teacher	Self-report	Yes	1++
36. Kasson & Wilson (2016)	Mindfulness- based strategies with a classroom behavior management treatment package	Quantitative	Case series	No control group	Teacher	Teacher report & observation	Yes	2-
37. Keller et al (2017)	10 week mindfulness education program	Mixed	RCT	Active control group	Researcher and teacher	Teacher report & cognitive tests	Yes	1+

Author (year)	MBI	Research design	Evaluation design	Control	Mediator	Outcome measure type	Teacher training	Evidence rating
38. Kielty et al (2017)	30-min classroom lessons from the Mindful Schools, Mindup curricula and original material developed	Mixed	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Researcher	Teacher report & self-report	No	2+
39. Klatt et al (2013)	Move-Into- Learning (MIL) 8 week intervention	Qualitative	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Researcher	Teacher report	No	2-
40. Kurth et al (2020)	Mindful Breathing Intervention	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Teacher	Computer task	Yes	1+
41. Lagor et al (2013)	8 week mindfulness group intervention	Mixed	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Teacher	Self-report	No	2-
42. Lam (2016)	MBCT - 80 minute weekly group sessions	Quantitative	RCT	Passive control group	Researcher	Self-report & parent report	No	1++
43. Lassander et al (2020)	Stop & Breathe	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Trained instructor	Neuropsycholo gical tests & self-reports	No	1++
44. Le & Gobert (2015)	Mind Body Awareness Project (MBA)	Mixed	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Researcher	Self-report	No	2+

Author (year)	MBI	Research design	Evaluation design	Control	Mediator	Outcome measure type	Teacher training	Evidence rating
45. Le & Trieu (2016)	Mind Body Awareness Project	Qualitative	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Teacher	Teacher report & self-report	No	3
46. Livheim et al (2015)	Australia: ACT Experiential Adolescent Group - 8 week program, Sweden: 6 week ACT group sessions	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Researcher	Self-report	No	1-
47. Malboeuf- Hurtubise et al (2017a)	8 week MBI	Quantitative	Case series	No control group	Researcher	Teacher report & self-report	No	2-
48. Malboeuf- Hurtubise et al (2017b)	8 week MBI	Quantitative	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Trained instructor	Self-report	No	2-
49. Metz et al (2013)	Learning to BREATHE	Quantitative	Pre-post (with non randomized control group)	Active control group	Teacher	Self-report	Yes	2+
50. Milligan et al (2016)	Mindfulness- based martial arts program	Quantitative	Pre-post (with non randomized control group)	Passive control group	Trained instructor	Self-report	No	2+
51. Napoli et al (2005)	24 week mindfulness training	Quantitative	RCT	Passive control group	Researcher	Teacher report & self-report	Yes	1+
52. Parker et al (2014)	Master Mind 4 week program	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Teacher	Teacher report	Yes	1-

Author (year)	MBI	Research design	Evaluation design	Control	Mediator	Outcome measure type	Teacher training	Evidence rating
53. Poehlmann- Tynan et al (2016)	12 week MBI	Qualitative	RCT	Active control group	Trained instructor	Observation and cognitive tests	No	1-
54. Raes et al (2014)	Combined elements of MBCT/ MBSR	Quantitative	RCT	Passive control group	Researcher	Self-report	No	1+
55. Ricarte et al (2015)	6 week MBI	Quantitative	RCT	Passive control group	Teacher	self-report, cognitive tests	No	1+
56. Rush et al (2017)	12 week mind- body curriculum	Quantitative	Pre-post (with non randomized control group)	Active control group	Researcher	Observation & cognitive tests	No	2-
57. Schonert- Reichl & Lawlor (2010)	Mindfulness Education Program	Quantitative	RCT	Passive control group	Teacher	Teacher report & self-report	Yes	1-
58. Schonert- Reichl et al (2015)	Mindup	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Teacher	Teacher report, self-report, and cognitive tests	No	1+
59. Schussler et al (2018)	CARE professional development	Qualitative	Case series	No control group	Researcher	Self-report	Yes	3
60. Sciutto et al (2021)	Mindful Schools, MindUp	Quantitative	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Mindfulness Instructor	Teacher Ratings	No	1++
61. Shapiro et al (2016)	Stressoff Strategies: CBT and mindfulness based techniques	Mixed	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Researcher	Self-report	No	2-

Author (year)	MBI	Research design	Evaluation design	Control	Mediator	Outcome measure type	Teacher training	Evidence rating
62. Sibinga et al (2013)	MBSR 12- session programs	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Researcher	Self-report	No	1-
63. Sibinga et al (2016)	MBSR - 12 week program	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Trained instructor	Self-report	No	1+
64. Terjestam et al (2016)	Compass program for 8 weeks	Quantitative	Pre-post (with non randomized control group)	Active control group	Teacher	Teacher report & self-report	Yes	2-
65. Tharaldsen (2012)	Conscious Coping Program	Mixed	RCT	Active control group	Researcher	Self-report & interviews	No	1-
66. Thomas & Atkinson (2017)	Paws.b.	Mixed	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Mindfulness instructor	Teacher report & self-report	No	1+
67. van de Weijer- Bergsma et al (2012)	Mindfulkids: 12 week session	Quantitative	RCT	Passive control group	Teacher and researcher	Teacher, parent, and child report	No	1-
68. Viafora et al (2015)	8 week mindfulness program	Mixed	Pre-post (with a non randomized control group	Passive control group	Researcher	Self-report	No	2-
69. Vickery & Dorjee (2016)	Paws B: 8 week intervention	Quantitative	Pre-post (with non randomized control group)	Passive control group	Teacher	Teacher, parent, & self-report	Yes	2-
70. Volanen et al (2020)	9 week MBI - healthy learning mind	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Trained instructor	Self-report	No	1++
71. Waldemar et al (2016)	Mindfulness practice	Quantitative	Pre-post (with non	Passive control group	Trained instructor	Teacher report & self-report	No	2-

Author (year)	MBI	Research design	Evaluation design	Control	Mediator	Outcome measure type	Teacher training	Evidence rating
			randomized control group)					
72. Wilson & Dixon (2010)	4 week mindfulness education program	Quantitative	ABA	No control group	Researcher	Observation	No	2-
73. Wimmer et al (2016)	Mindfulness and concentration training	Quantitative	RCT	Passive control group	Researcher	Cognitive tests	Yes	1-
74. Wisner (2013)	Mindfulness meditation program: 8 week intervention	Qualitative	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Researcher	Self-report	No	2+
75. Wisner & Starzec (2016)	Mindfulness practices (mindfulness skills and journal entries)	Qualitative	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Researcher and teacher	Self-report	No	2-
76. Worthen & Luiselli (2017)	Mindfulness: An Eight Week Plan for Finding Peace in a Frantic World	Quantitative	Pre-post comparison (without a control group)	No control group	Researcher	Self-report	No	1+
77. Zelazo et al (2018)	Mindfulness and reflection training: 6 week intervention	Quantitative	RCT	Active control group	Teacher	Teacher report & cognitive tests	Yes	1-

Note. N/A means not available, MBI = Mindfulness Based Interventions, ACT = Acceptance and Commitment Therapy, MBSR = Mindfulness-based stress reduction, MBCT = Mindfulness-Based Cognitive Therapy