

# **Mindfulness-based school interventions: A systematic review of outcome evidence quality by study design**

## *Mindfulness*

Mary L. Phan<sup>1</sup>, Tyler L. Renshaw<sup>1</sup>, Julie Caramanico<sup>2</sup>, Jeffrey M. Greeson<sup>3</sup>, Elizabeth MacKenzie<sup>4</sup>, Zabryna Atkinson-Diaz<sup>2</sup>, Natalie Doppelt<sup>2</sup>, Hungtzu Tai<sup>5</sup>, David S. Mandell<sup>2</sup>, and Heather J. Nuske<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Psychology, Utah State University, Logan, USA

<sup>2</sup>Penn Center for Mental Health, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, USA

<sup>3</sup>Department of Psychology, Rowan University, Glassboro, USA

<sup>4</sup>Graduate School of Education, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, USA

<sup>5</sup>School of Health in Social Science, University of Edinburgh, United Kingdom

Corresponding author email: [mary.phan@usu.edu](mailto:mary.phan@usu.edu)

## Online Resource 1

### *Demographics Included in Review*

Author (year)	Country	Participants: Sample size	Child gender	Child age range	Child ethnicity	SES	Children with special needs? (If yes, specify)	School level	Classroom setting	Public vs Private
01. Atkinson & Wade (2015)	Australia	347	All female	14-18	Caucasian (84%), with the remainder identifying as Asian (8%), African (1%), or Other (4%)	N/A	No	High school	General ed	Two catholic schools and two private schools
02. Bakosh et al (2016)	USA	93	50 male 43 female	N/A	N/A	Some are from low SES (23% of the participants)	No	Elementary school	General ed	Public
03. Bakosh et al (2018)	USA	337	161 girls, 176 boys	6-11	74% Hispanic (school 1); 97% White (school 2)	one school mainly low SES students, while the other is not	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A
04. Bannirchelvam et al (2017)	Australia	8	4 girls, 4 boys	7-11	N/A	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	Public
05. Bauer et al (2019)	USA	40	70% female, 30% male	M=11.76	10% Hispanic, 32.5% African American, 52.5% White, and 5% other or multiple racial identities	47.5% are low income families	No	Middle school	General ed	Public
06. Beauchemin et al (2008)	USA	34	71% male	8-12	N/A	N/A	Learning Disability	High school	Special ed	Private

Author (year)	Country	Participants: Sample size	Child gender	Child age range	Child ethnicity	SES	Children with special needs? (If yes, specify)	School level	Classroom setting	Public vs Private
07. Bei et al (2013)	USA	62	All female	13-15	N/A	N/A	No	High school	General ed	Private
08. Bennett & Dorjee (2015)	UK	23	N/A	16-18	N/A	N/A	No	High school	General ed	N/A
09. Berger et al (2018)	Israel	224	137 females	8-11	N/A	Middle class	No	Elementary school	General ed	Public
10. Bernay et al (2016)	New Zealand	124	53% female and 47% male	9-12	82 European, 36 Asian, 6 other	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	Public
11. Black & Fernando (2014)	USA	409	N/A	N/A	52.3 % Hispanic, 28.0 % Black, 15.0 % Asian, 4.3 % White, and .4 % other	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	Public
12. Bluth et al (2016)	USA	27	73% male, 27% female	14-18	54 % Hispanic, 24% African- American, 18% Caucasian, and 3% other	N/A	No	High school	Alternative school	Alternative school

Author (year)	Country	Participants: Sample size	Child gender	Child age range	Child ethnicity	SES	Children with special needs? (If yes, specify)	School level	Classroom setting	Public vs Private
13. Bradley et al (2018)	USA	507 students, 49 teachers	Students: 258 male, 249 female; teachers: 37 female 12 males	Student M = 9.3, teacher M = 45.9	Student: 53% Caucasian, 15.5% Hispanic/Latino, 9.9% Asian/Indian, 8.2% Multiracial, 6.9% African American, 3.2% Asian American, 2.4% Middle Eastern, and 0.4% Native American. Teacher: 87.8% Caucasian, 2.0% Hispanic/Latino, 2.0% African American, and 8.2% Other	N/A	No	Elementary and middle school	General ed	Private
14. Britton et al (2014)	USA	101	55 boys, 46 girls	M=11.79	N/A	N/A	No	Middle school	General ed	N/A
15. Broderick & Metz (2009)	USA	120	All female	M=17.4	93.3% White, 2.5% Hispanic, 2.5% Asian, 1.7% other	N/A	No	High school	General ed	Private
16. Burckhardt et al (2017)	Australia	48	58% males, 42% females	14-16	N/A	Socio- economically advantaged	No	High school	General ed	Private

Author (year)	Country	Participants: Sample size	Child gender	Child age range	Child ethnicity	SES	Children with special needs? (If yes, specify)	School level	Classroom setting	Public vs Private
17. Costello & Lawler (2014)	Ireland	63	17 boys, 46 girls	11-12	N/A	At risk of socioeconomic exclusion	No	Middle school	General ed	N/A
18. Crescentini et al (2016)	Italy	16	8 boys 8 girls	7-8	N/A	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A
19. Davenport & Pagnini (2016)	USA	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	Mixed
20. der Gucht et al (2017)	Belgium	605	70% female	13-20	N/A	N/A	No	High school	General ed	N/A
21. Dove & Costello (2017)	Australia	57	37 males	9-10	N/A	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A
22. Emerson et al (2017)	UK	26	14 girls, 12 boys	M=6.6	Mostly White	N/A	Autism spectrum disorder, Down syndrome	Elementary school	General ed	N/A
23. Eva & Thayer (2017)	USA	23	65% male	17-20	75% African American	N/A	No	High school	Alternative school	Alternative school
24. Felver et al (2013)	USA	3	All male	8-9	N/A	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	Public
25. Flook et al (2015)	USA	68	34 girls (50.0%) and 33 boys (48.5%)	M = 4.67	40 White (58.8%), 8 Hispanic (11.8%), 4 African American (5.9%), 7 Asian/Pacific Islander (10.3%), 8 "Other"/mixed ethnicity children (11.8%)	Low SES	No	Elementary school	General ed	Public
26. Franco et al (2016)	Spain	27	59% boys, 41% girls	12-19	N/A	N/A	No	High school	General ed	Public
27. Fung et al (2016)	USA	19	8 boys, 11 girls	12-14	Asian and Latino	N/A	No	Elementary and middle school	General ed	Public

Author (year)	Country	Participants: Sample size	Child gender	Child age range	Child ethnicity	SES	Children with special needs? (If yes, specify)	School level	Classroom setting	Public vs Private
28. Gouda et al (2016)	Germany	29 students, 29 teachers	All female students, N/A teachers	Student M = 16.2, teacher m=45.9	N/A	N/A	No	High school	General ed	N/A
29. Gould et al (2012)	USA	97	60.8% female, 39.2% male	9.7-10.6	83.5% African American, 4.1% Latino, 4.1% Caucasian, 7.2% other	Low SES	No	Elementary school	General ed	Public
30. Idler et al (2017)	British Columbia	4	2 girls, 2 boys	8-11	Mostly English	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	Private
31. Janz et al (2019)	Australia	55	34 boys, 21 girls	M=6.3	8% indigenous Australian, 23% had a language background other than English	Low SES	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A
32. Johnson et al (2016)	Australia	308	47.7% female, 52.3% male	M=13.63	N/A	N/A	No	High school	General ed	One private, three public
33. Johnson et al (2017)	Australia	555	45.4% girls, 54.6% boys	M=13.4	N/A	A broad range of socioeconomic status	No	High school	General ed	One private, three public
34. Juliano et al (2020)	USA	27	77.8% boys	M=13.60	88.9 % White, 3.7 % African American, 4.4% Hispanic	N/A	Autism Spectrum Disorder	Middle and high school	General ed	Private
35. Kang et al (2018)	USA	100	46 females, 54 males	M = 11.79	N/A	N/A	N/A	Middle School	General Ed	Private
36. Kasson & Wilson (2016)	USA	21	61.5% male	M= 8.5	N/A	N/A	No	Elementary and middle school	General ed	N/A

Author (year)	Country	Participants: Sample size	Child gender	Child age range	Child ethnicity	SES	Children with special needs? (If yes, specify)	School level	Classroom setting	Public vs Private
37. Keller et al (2017)	USA	28	64% female, 36% male	10-11	89% Hispanic, 11% Black	Low SES	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A
38. Kielty et al (2017)	USA	45	22 girls, 22 boys, 1 unidentified	8-9	84% Caucasian	Low SES	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A
39. Klatt et al (2013)	USA	41	16 boys 25 girls	M=8.54	8 Caucasian, 18 African American, 11 Somali, 4 Hispanic	Low SES	No	Elementary school	General ed	Public
40. Kurth et al (2020)	Germany	106	58% female, 42% male	5-11	German	N/A	N/A	Elementary school	General Ed	Public
41. Lagor et al (2013)	USA	15	9 females, 6 males	8-18	11 African American, 2 White, 1 biracial, 1 Latino	Annual income less than \$30,000	No	Middle and high school	Special ed	Specialized school
42. Lam (2016)	China	20	11 females 9 male	9-13	Chinese	Lower to middle class	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A
43. Lassander et al (2020)	Finland	131	56.5% females, 43.5% males	12-15	Finnish	N/A	N/A	Middle School	General Ed	Public
44. Le & Gobert (2015)	USA	8	5 males	15-20	Native American	N/A	No	High school	General ed	N/A
45. Le & Trieu (2016)	Vietnam	10	N/A	15-18	Vietnamese	N/A	No	High school	General Ed	A semi-private school and a vocational school
46. Livheim et al (2015)	Australia & Sweden	Australia study: 66, Sweden: 32	Australia: 8 male, 58 female Sweden: 9 male, 23 female	Australia: 12-18, Sweden: 14-15	Australian and Swedish	N/A	No	High school	General ed and one alternative school	N/A
47. Malboeuf-Hurtubise et al (2017a)	Canada	3	2 boys 1 girl	9-10	1 Caucasian, 1 Haitian, 1 Hispanic	Low SES	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A

Author (year)	Country	Participants: Sample size	Child gender	Child age range	Child ethnicity	SES	Children with special needs? (If yes, specify)	School level	Classroom setting	Public vs Private
48. Malboeuf-Hurtubise et al (2017b)	Canada	14	8 girls, 6 boys	M=10.7	N/A	Low SES	Learning Disability	Elementary school	Special ed	N/A
49. Metz et al (2013)	USA	244	34.9% male, 65.1% female	M=16.5	90% White, 10% other (Latino, Black, Asian or Native American)	Middle to high income	No	High school	General ed	Public
50. Milligan et al (2016)	USA	17	10 males 7 females	13-17	N/A	N/A	No	High school	General ed	N/A
51. Napoli et al (2005)	USA	228	120 males 108 females	N/A	N/A	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A
52. Parker et al (2014)	USA	71	30 boys, 41 girls	9-11	64 European-American, 14 African American, 23 other	N/A	No	Elementary School	General ed	A semi-private school and a vocational school
53. Poehlmann-Tynan et al (2016)	USA	29	51% boys, 49% girls	3-5	72% non-white	Low SES	No	Preschool	General ed	N/A
54. Raes et al (2014)	Belgium	408	68% female 33% male	13-20	N/A	N/A	No	High school	General ed	N/A
55. Ricarte et al (2015)	Spain	45	29 boys, 16 girls	6-13	Spanish	Low SES	No	Middle school	General ed	Public
56. Rush et al (2017)	USA	33	29 boys 4 girls	8-13	N/A	N/A	Emotional disturbance (ED)	Elementary and middle school	Special ed	N/A
57. Schonert-Reichl & Lawlor (2010)	Canada	246	48% female	9-13	57% English speaking, 23% east Asian, 20% other (Spanish, Russian, Polish)	Median income level	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A



Author (year)	Country	Participants: Sample size	Child gender	Child age range	Child ethnicity	SES	Children with special needs? (If yes, specify)	School level	Classroom setting	Public vs Private
58. Schonert-Reichl et al (2015)	Canada	99	44% female, 46% male	9-11	66 % English speaking, 25% east Asian, 10% other (Russian, Spanish, Polish)	Median level	No	Elementary school	General ed	Public
59. Schussler et al (2018)	USA	21 teachers	N/A	22-73	33% white, 31% Hispanic, 26% African American, 4% Asian American, and 5% mixed background	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A
60. Scitutto et al (2021)	USA	105	47 females, 58 males	5-9	77% Hispanic, 13% African American, 5% White, 3% Multi-Racial, 1% Asian	94% receive free or reduced lunch	N/A	Elementary school	General Ed	Public
61. Shapiro et al (2016)	Canada	565	57.52% female, 42.48% male	14-16	N/A	Low SES urban (10%), middle SES urban (30%), middle SES suburban (40%), to high SES independent fee based (20%)	No	High school	General ed	Public

Author (year)	Country	Participants: Sample size	Child gender	Child age range	Child ethnicity	SES	Children with special needs? (If yes, specify)	School level	Classroom setting	Public vs Private
62. Sibinga et al (2013)	USA	44	All boys	M=12.5	95% African American	Low SES	No	Middle school	General ed	N/A
63. Sibinga et al (2016)	USA	300	50.7% female	M= 12	99.7% African American	N/A	No	Elementary and middle school	General ed	Public
64. Terjestam et al (2016)	Sweden	358	173 girls, 185 boys	10-14	N/A	Mostly urban to low-income area	No	High school	General ed	Public
65. Tharaldsen (2012)	Norway	40	75% female 25% male	17-21	N/A	N/A	No	High school	Vocational and general ed	Public
66. Thomas & Atkinson (2017)	UK	30	50% female	8-10	Ethnically diverse	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A
67. van de Weijer-Bergsma et al (2012)	Netherlands	208	110 females, 98 males	8-12	Ethnically diverse	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	Public
68. Viafora et al (2015)	USA	38	22 females, 16 males	7-18	34 Latino, 1 White, 1 African American, 2 mixed race/other	N/A (but there are low-SES students involved)	No	Middle and high school	General ed	Charter school
69. Vickery & Dorjee (2016)	UK	71	36 male	7-9	N/A	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A
70. Volanen et al (2020)	Finland	3519	1,752 boys, girls 1,750	12-15	Finnish	N/A	No	Middle school	General ed	N/A
71. Waldemar et al (2016)	Brazil	132	52.3% male	10-14	52.7% hite	Lower to middle class	No	Elementary school	General ed	Public
72. Wilson & Dixon (2010)	USA	12	5 males, 7 females	M=8	N/A	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	Private
73. Wimmer et al (2016)	Germany	34	16 male, 18 female	M=10.8	N/A	N/A	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A
74. Wisner (2013)	USA	35	19 boys 16 girls	15-19	34 Caucasian, 1 African American	N/A	No	High school	Alternative school	Public

Author (year)	Country	Participants: Sample size	Child gender	Child age range	Child ethnicity	SES	Children with special needs? (If yes, specify)	School level	Classroom setting	Public vs Private
75. Wisner & Starzec (2016)	USA	19	10 boys 9 girls	15-17	17 Caucasian, 1 African American, 1 Hispanic, 1 European American	Low SES	No	High school	Alternative school	Public
76. Worthen & Luiselli (2017)	USA	84	50% male 50% female	M=14.5	N/A	N/A	No	High school	General ed	Private
77. Zelazo et al (2018)	USA	218	101 males 117 females	47-63 months	55% White, 32% more than one race, African American 9%, native American 3%	Low SES	No	Elementary school	General ed	N/A

Note. N/A means not available